DNA Mixture Interpretation Principles: Observations from a NIST Scientific Foundation Review AAFS 2019 Workshop #10 (February 18, 2019; Baltimore, MD)

Exploring Capabilities and Limitations: Capabilities of Probabilistic Genotyping with Mixtures of Biological Family Members

Lisa Schiermeier-Wood

Virginia Department of Forensic Science





2017 SWGDAM Interpretation Guidelines for Autosomal STR Typing by Forensic DNA Testing Laboratories

- Binary statistical models typically assume unrelated individuals
 - **3.2.7** Statistical models commonly used for estimating DNA profile rarity typically involve an assumption of unrelated individuals...
 - "The probability of randomly selecting an unrelated individual with a DNA profile matching that of the [evidence] is approximately..."
- 4B.11 Likelihood ratios can be applied to mixtures of close biological relatives if the assumptions include the unknown contributor(s) are unrelated to the assumed contributors
 - _____ times more likely to be observed if it originated from the VICTIM and SUSPECT than if it originated from the VICTIM and an unknown individual in the Caucasian population.

Study Design

- 11 families with 1-4 children
 - 2 families: 1 child
 - 4 families: 2 children
 - 4 families: 3 children
 - 1 family: 4 children
- DNA adjusted to 0.1ng/ul
- PowerPlex[®] Fusion amplifications contained ~0.5ng input DNA
- GMIDX® used to interpret mixture profiles
- .hid files uploaded to $\mathsf{TrueAllele}^{\mathbb{R}}$
- TrueAllele® protocol used in accordance with routine casework

Study Design (cont'd)

- Two contributor mixtures:
 - M + F 1:1; 1:4 and 4:1
 - 11 families = 33 mixtures

- TrueAllele[®] runs:
 - 2c as 2uk
 - 2c as 3uk
 - 2c as 1 uk + M or F (selected mixtures)
 - 3c as 1uk + M + F (selected mixtures)

Key:

M – mother

F – father

c – contributor

uk - unknown

Evaluating Results

- Runs not meeting DFS' acceptance criteria were not used.
 - GR (Gelman-Rubin) convergence value above 1.5 were not used.
 - Match scores not reproducible within 2 ban were not considered.

2c as 2uk – Selected Family



2c as 2uk w/ Mixture Ratios



Family A ~1:1 mixture



Family D ~1:24 mixture



Family B mixture



Sequentially solving with assumed known contributors

- 2c mixtures previously demonstrating adventitious matches to biological children were solved as 1uk assuming mother and 1uk assuming father
- A few mixtures needed additional runs to solve

Sequentially solving with assumed known contributors



Resolution of adventitious matches using assumed knowns



Conclusions

- Mixtures of parents can adventitiously include biological children
 Not all mixtures will result in positive match scores to biological children
- Using a step-wise process of sequentially adding assumed references is an effective means of eliminating adventitious matches
- VA DFS Policy uses likelihood ratios generated by probabilistic genotyping when close biological relatives are included in the same DNA profile